IN VIVO EVALUATION OF A COLORIMETER FOR SHADE DETERMINATION IN DENTISTRY

Quiterrie Fresne¹, Maiwenn Jacquin¹, Luís Proença², Ana Mano Azul², Joana Costa²

¹ Egas Moniz School of Health & Science, 2829-511 Almada, Portugal

² Egas Moniz Center for Interdisciplinary Research (CiiEM); Egas Moniz School of Health & Science, 2829-511 Almada, Portugal

INTRODUCTION

Accurate and reproducible tooth shade determination is essential in dentistry, as even minor color discrepancies can compromise diagnosis and treatment success [1]. However, shade selection remains a clinical challenge due to its inherent subjectivity and variability among clinicians [2-4]. Currently, several methods are available for tooth color determination, including both manual and instrumental approaches [5-6]. The Optishade Style Italiano TM (OSI, Smile Line, St-Imier, Switzerland) is an instrumental colorimeter designed to reduce such subjectivity and variability [7-9]. Despite its introduction in 2015, no in vivo studies have yet evaluated its reliability.

AIMS

This pilot study aimed to evaluate the reliability of the OSI colorimeter for tooth color measurement in Dentistry, based on the L*, a*, and b* parameters of the CIELab system.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Egas Moniz University Clinic

Patient recruitment.



- In the same clinical space (one box)
- Between 3 and 6 pm
- Feb May

This box was chosen because it was located near a window so that there would be light coming from a natural source.





40 patients

Patient selection according to inclusion and exclusion criteria:



- Prior consent;
- Adults (>18 years);
- All teeth of the 2nd sextant.



- Makeup and lipstick;
- Restorations;
- No prior bleaching treatments;
- Stains, tartar, fluorosis, hypoplasia;
- Pregnant women;
- Smoking habits;
- Ongoing orthodontic treatment;
- Use of mouthwash and/or mouthwash or color-modifying medications;
- Non-vital teeth, with developmental anomalies or anatomically altered.
- 3. Explanation of the procedures to be performed with delivery and signature of the informed consent form.
- 4. Connection and calibration of the OSI according to the manufacturer's instructions: connecting to the iPhone, download and open the Optishade[®] app, press the main button on your device for 3 s, place the white background calibration cap and click on calibrate-
- 5. Color measurement: OSI placement close to the tooth at 90° in relation to the vestibular surface of the maxillary anterior incisors (teeth 11 and 21) by two calibrated operators (operator Q and M).
- 6. L*, a*, and b* values recorded in three thirds (cervical, middle and incisal).
- 7. Repeated measurements by each operator seven days later (Q2 and M2).



RESULTS

8. Intra- and inter-operator reliability assessment using the intraclass correlation coefficient (ICC) [IBM SPSS Statistics software v. 28.0 (IBM Corp., Armonk, NY, USA].

For the L* and a* parameters of the CIELab system, the concordance between appointments and operators showed ICC values between 0.5 and 0.75, indicating a moderate reliability of the instrument. In contrast, higher ICC values were obtained for b*, reflecting excellent reliability for this parameter (Tables 1 and 2).

Table 1. Determination of the intraclass correlation coefficient (ICC) between the two appointments of each operator (results indicated with confidence interval, 95% CI).

Operator	L*		a*		b*	
	ICC	[-CI 95%-]	ICC	[-CI 95%-]	ICC	[-Cl 95%-]
	Reliability		Reliability		Reliability	
Q1-Q2	0.535	[0.270;0.724]	0.653	[0.435;0.799]	0.895	[0.811;0.943]
	Moderate		Moderate		Good	
M1-M2	0.650	[0,428;0,798]	0.641	[0.415;0.792]	0.900	[0.819;0.946]
	Moderate		Moderate		Excellent	

Table 2. Determination of the intraclass correlation coefficient (ICC) between the two operators for each appointment (results indicated with confidence interval, 95% CI).

Operator	L*		a*		b*	
	ICC	[-CI 95%-]	ICC	[-Cl 95%-]	ICC	[-CI 95%-]
	Reliability		Reliability		Reliability	
Q1-M1	0.491	[0.346;0.761]	0.700	[0.447;0.840]	0.900	[0.819;0.945]
	Moderate		Moderate		Good	
Q2-M2	0.564	[0.314;0.742]	0.691	[0.488;0.823]	0.956	[0.918;0.976]
	Moderate		Moderate		Excellent	

CONCLUSIONS

The OSI colorimeter, when used to evaluate the parameters of the CIELab system for color measurement in Dentistry, demonstrated greater reliability for the b* parameter, while its reliability was only moderate for the L* and a* parameters. These findings support the potential of OSI as a useful tool in clinical shade determination. Future studies should include comparisons with other visual and instrumental methods and assess reliability across different thirds. Expanding the demographic diversity of participants will further validate the device for broader clinical use.

REFERENCES

- 1. Liberato WF, Barreto IC, Costa PP, de Almeida CC, Pimentel W, Tiossi R. A comparison between visual, intraoral scanner, and spectrophotometer shade matching: A clinical study. J Prosthet Dent. 2019;121(2):271–5. doi:10.1016/j.prosdent.2018.05.004
- Chu SJ, Trushkowsky RD, Paravina RD. Dental color matching instruments and systems. Review of clinical and research aspects. J Dent. 2010;38(Suppl 2). doi:10.1016/j.jdent.2010.07.001
- Igiel C, Weyhrauch M, Wentaschek S, Scheller H, Lehmann KM. Dental color matching: A comparison between visual and instrumental methods. Dent Mater J. 2016;35(1):63–9. doi:10.4012/dmj.2015-006
- 4. Trigo-Humaran MM, Agüero-Romero AB, Lespade M, García-Cuerva JM, Iglesias ME. Tooth color in dental students from Buenos Aires University, Dental School, Argentina. Acta Odontol Latinoam. 2022;35(2):98–104. doi:10.54589/aol.35/2/98
- 5. Alayed M, Alnasyan A, Aljutayli A, Alzaben M, Alrusayni W, Al Hujaylan A. Considerations and implications in shade selection for dental restorations: A review. J Pharm Bioallied Sci. 2021;13(6):S898–902. doi:10.4103/jpbs.jpbs_218_21
- Morsy N, Holiel AA. Color difference for shade determination with visual and instrumental methods: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Syst Rev. 2023;12(1):95. doi:10.1186/s13643-023-02263-9
- Cone MR, Choi J, Awdaljan M. Optimized digital shade calibration technology for the restoration of a single central incisor. J Prosthet Dent. 2022;128(1):1–3. doi:10.1016/j.prosdent.2022.05.027
- Lin HN, Wang LC, Chen MS, Chang PJ, Lin PY, Fang A, et al. Discoloration improvement by mechanically-milled binary oxides as radiopacifier for mineral trioxide aggregates. Materials (Basel). 2022;15(22). doi:10.3390/ma15227934
- Lobito A, Colaço C, Costa J, Caldeira J, Proença L, Mendes JJ. In vitro evaluation of surface roughness and color variation after two brushing protocols with toothpastes containing different whitening technologies. Appl Sci. 2024;14(10):4053. doi:10.3390/app14104053